

Grading Rubric: Critical Analysis Papers (5 points possible)

[1] Writing quality (2 points possible)

Excellent writing skills: paragraphs have points; sentences well constructed; argument is clear from beginning to end = 2 points

Very good writing: most paragraphs have points; most sentences well constructed; but occasional lapses = 1½ points

Passable writing: paragraphs have one or more or no point, but occasionally are clear; sentences are often well constructed but sometimes not; argument is difficult if impossible to discern = ½ - 1 point

Not passable writing: spelling errors; incomplete sentences; unclear points; no argument = 0 points

[2] Method of critiquing argument (3 points possible)

a) Identifying assumptions & replicating argument (1 point possible)

Identifies key assumption & replicates argument of paper = 1 point

Identifies key assumption but no replication; or, replications, but without identifying assumptions = ½ points

Neither identifies key assumption nor replicates argument = 0 points

b) alternative assumption & alternative conclusion (2 points possible)

Excellent: Offers reasonable alternative assumption, argues to new conclusion, offers suggestions for how to verify validity of alternative assumption = 2 points

Good: Offers reasonable alternative assumption, argues to new conclusion, but does not offer suggestions for how to verify validity of alternative assumption = 1½ points

Passable: Offers reasonable alternative assumption, argues to new conclusion, but leaps or flaws of logic in argument = 1 point

Not passable: doesn't get it = 0 points